09-4468 Docket Page 1 of 8

General Docket Third Circuit Court of Appeals

Court of Appeals Docket #: 09-4468 **Docketed: 12/01/2009** Nature of Suit: 3410 Antitrust **Termed:** 11/29/2010

W Penn Alghny Health Sys v. UPMC, et al

Appeal From: United States District Court for the Western District of Pennsylvania

Fee Status: Paid

Case Type Information:

1) civil

2) private

3) Federal question

Originating Court Information: District: 0315-2 : <u>2-09-cv-00480</u>

Trial Judge: Arthur J Schwab, U.S. District Judge

Date Filed: 04/21/2009

Date Order/Judgment EOD: **Date Order/Judgment:** Date NOA Filed: 10/29/2009 11/20/2009 10/29/2009

Prior Cases:

None

Current Cases:

None

W PENN ALLEGHENY HEALTH SYSTEM

Plaintiff - Appellant

Barak A. Bassman, Esq. Direct: 215-981-4771

Email: bassmanb@pepperlaw.com

[COR NTC Retained] Pepper Hamilton 18th & Arch Streets 3000 Two Logan Square Philadelphia, PA 19103-0000

Andrew K. Fletcher, Esq. Direct: 412-454-5000 Email: fletchea@pepperlaw.com

Fax: 412-281-0717 [Retained] Pepper Hamilton 500 Grant Street 50th Floor

Pittsburgh, PA 15219-0000

James T. Giles, I, Esq. Direct: 215-981-4131 Email: gilesj@pepperlaw.com Fax: 800-353-1368 [COR NTC Retained] Pepper Hamilton 18th & Arch Streets 3000 Two Logan Square Philadelphia, PA 19103-0000

Barbara W. Mather, Esq. Direct: 215-981-4895 Email: matherb@pepperlaw.com Fax: 215-981-4750 [COR NTC Retained] Pepper Hamilton 18th & Arch Streets

3000 Two Logan Square Philadelphia, PA 19103-0000

Barbara T. Sicalides, Esq. Direct: 215-981-4783 Email: sicalidesb@pepperlaw.com [COR NTC Retained]

Pepper Hamilton 18th & Arch Streets 09-4468 Docket Page 2 of 8

3000 Two Logan Square Philadelphia, PA 19103-0000 ٧. **UPMC** Jonathan M. Jacobson, Esq. Direct: 212-497-7758 Defendant - Appellee Email: jjacobson@wsgr.com [COR NTC Retained] Wilson, Sonsini, Goodrich & Rosati 1301 Avenue of the Americas 40th Floor New York, NY 10019 Nilam A. Sanghvi, Esq. Direct: 215-751-2268 Email: nsanghvi@schnader.com Fax: 215-751-2205 [COR NTC Retained] Schnader Harrison Segal & Lewis 1600 Market Street **Suite 3600** Philadelphia, PA 19103 Paul H. Titus, Esq. Direct: 412-577-5224 Email: ptitus@schnader.com Fax: 412-765-3858 [COR NTC Retained] Schnader Harrison Segal & Lewis 120 Fifth Avenue 2700 Fifth Avenue Place Pittsburgh, PA 15222-0000 Nancy Winkelman, Esq. Direct: 215-751-2342 Email: nwinkelman@schnader.com Fax: 215-751-2205 [COR NTC Retained] Schnader Harrison Segal & Lewis 1600 Market Street Suite 3600 Philadelphia, PA 19103 HIGHMARK INC Daniel I. Booker, Esq. Defendant - Appellee Direct: 412-288-3132 Email: dbooker@reedsmith.com Fax: 412-288-3063 [COR NTC Retained] Reed Smith Suite 1200 225 Fifth Avenue **Suite 1200** Pittsburgh, PA 15222 Jeffrey J. Bresch, Esq. Direct: 412-288-3834 Email: jbresch@reedsmith.com Fax: 412-288-3063 [COR NTC Retained] Reed Smith **Suite 1200** 225 Fifth Avenue **Suite 1200** Pittsburgh, PA 15222 Donna M. Doblick, Esq. Direct: 412-288-7274 Email: ddoblick@reedsmith.com Fax: 412-288-3063 [COR NTC Retained] Reed Smith 225 Fifth Avenue **Suite 1200**

09-4468 Docket Page 3 of 8

Pittsburgh, PA 15222

Paul G. Eastgate, Esq. Direct: 412-288-5710 Email: geastgate@reedsmith.com Fax: 412-288-3063 [COR NTC Retained] Reed Smith Suite 1200 225 Fifth Avenue

Suite 1200 Pittsburgh, PA 15222

09-4468 Docket Page 4 of 8

| WEST PENN ALLEGHENY HEALTH SYSTEM, INC., | | | |
|--|--|--|--|
| Appellant | | | |
| v. | | | |
| UPMC; HIGHMARK, INC. | | | |

09-4468 Docket Page 5 of 8

| 12/01/2009 | 84 pg, 346.7 KB | CIVIL CASE DOCKETED. Notice filed by Appellant West Penn Alghny Health Sys Inc[Edited 12/03/2009 by TYW] (TYW) | |
|------------|------------------|--|--|
| 12/01/2009 | | RECORD available on District Court CM/ECF. (TYW) | |
| 12/02/2009 | 1 pg, 34.98 KB | ECF FILER: ENTRY OF APPEARANCE from Donna M. Doblick on behalf of Appellee(s) Highmark Inc. (DMD) | |
| 12/02/2009 | 1 pg, 17.54 KB | ECF FILER: ENTRY OF APPEARANCE from Jonathan M. Jacobson on behalf of Appellee(s) UPMC. (JMJ) $$ | |
| 12/03/2009 | 1 pg, 29.91 KB | ECF FILER: ENTRY OF APPEARANCE from P. Gavin Eastgate on behalf of Appellee(s) Highmark Inc (PGE) | |
| 12/03/2009 | 1 pg, 271.21 KB | ECF FILER: ENTRY OF APPEARANCE from Jeffrey J. Bresch on behalf of Appellee(s) Highmark Inc (JJB) | |
| 12/03/2009 | 1 pg, 29.04 KB | ECF FILER: ENTRY OF APPEARANCE from Daniel I. Booker on behalf of Appellee(s) Highmark Inc (DIB) | |
| 12/03/2009 | 2 pg, 50.83 KB | ECF FILER: DISCLOSURE STATEMENT on behalf of Appellee Highmark Inc, filed. (PGE) | |
| 12/15/2009 | 1 pg, 36.55 KB | ECF FILER: ENTRY OF APPEARANCE from Ms. Barbara W. Mather on behalf of Appellant(s) West Penn Allegheny Health System,Inc (BWM) | |
| 12/15/2009 | 1 pg, 34.87 KB | ECF FILER: ENTRY OF APPEARANCE from Mr. Barak A. Bassman on behalf of Appellant(s) West Penn Allegheny Health System,Inc (BAB) | |
| 12/15/2009 | 2 pg, 63.04 KB | ECF FILER: CIVIL INFORMATION STATEMENT on behalf of Appellant W Penn Alghny Health, filed. (BAB) | |
| 12/15/2009 | 2 pg, 80.27 KB | ECF FILER: Concise Summary of the Case filed by Appellant W Penn Alghny Health, received. (BAB) | |
| 12/15/2009 | 2 pg, 55.63 KB | ECF FILER: DISCLOSURE STATEMENT on behalf of Appellant W Penn Alghny Health, filed. (BAB) | |
| 12/15/2009 | 1 pg, 41.08 KB | ECF FILER: Transcript Purchase Order Form (Part 1) filed by Appellant W Penn Alghny Health advising this court that transcripts are already on file in the District Court. (BAB) | |
| 12/17/2009 | 2 pg, 74.1 KB | BRIEFING NOTICE ISSUED. Brief and Appendix on behalf of Appellant W Penn Alghny Health due on or before 01/26/2010. (TYW) | |
| 12/17/2009 | 1 pg, 48.57 KB | ECF FILER: ENTRY OF APPEARANCE from Ms. Barbara T. Sicalides on behalf of Appellant(s) West Penn Allegheny Health System, Inc. (BTS) | |
| 12/21/2009 | 1 pg, 49.36 KB | ECF FILER: ENTRY OF APPEARANCE from Paul H. Titus on behalf of Appellee(s) UPMC. (NAS) | |
| 12/21/2009 | 1 pg, 49.09 KB | ECF FILER: ENTRY OF APPEARANCE from Nilam A. Sanghvi on behalf of Appellee(s) UPMC. (NAS) | |
| 12/21/2009 | 2 pg, 80.13 KB | ECF FILER: DISCLOSURE STATEMENT on behalf of Appellee UPMC, filed. (NAS) | |
| 01/20/2010 | 1 pg, 44.9 KB | ECF FILER: ENTRY OF APPEARANCE from Mr. James T. Giles on behalf of Appellant(s) West Penn Allegheny Health System, Inc (JTG) | |
| 01/25/2010 | 4 pg, 18.25 KB | ECF FILER: UNOPPOSED Motion filed by Appellee Highmark Inc to seal Supplemental Appendix. Certificate of Service dated 01/25/2010. SEND TO MERITS PANEL[Edited 02/08/2010 by TMK] (PGE) | |
| 01/25/2010 | 4 pg, 16.79 KB | ECF FILER: UNOPPOSED Motion by Appellee UPMC to File Supplemental Appendix under Seal, filed. Certificate of Service dated 01/25/2010[Edited 01/25/2010 by TMK] SEND TO MERITS PANEL[Edited 02/08/2010 by TMK] (JMJ) | |
| 01/26/2010 | 78 pg, 216.88 KB | ECF FILER: ELECTRONIC BRIEF on behalf of Appellant W Penn Alghny Health, filed. Certificate of Service dated 01/26/2010 by hand delivery, email. (BAB) | |
| 01/26/2010 | 88 pg, 404 KB | ECF FILER: ELECTRONIC JOINT APPENDIX on behalf of Appellant W Penn Alghny Health, filed. Certificate of service dated 01/26/2010 by email. (BAB) | |
| 01/26/2010 | 893 pg, 52.12 MB | ECF FILER: ELECTRONIC JOINT APPENDIX on behalf of Appellant W Penn Alghny Health, filed. Certificate of service dated 01/26/2010 by email. (BAB) | |
| 01/26/2010 | 0 pg, 0 KB | ECF FILER: SEALED ELECTRONIC APPENDIX on behalf of Appellant W Penn Alghny Health, filed. Certificate of Service dated 01/26/2010 by email. (BAB) | |

09-4468 Docket Page 6 of 8

| 01/27/2010 | | HARD COPY RECEIVED from Appellant W Penn Alghny Health - Brief with Volume I of Joint Appendix attached. Copies: 10. (KEL) | | |
|------------|------------------|--|--|--|
| 01/27/2010 | | HARD COPY RECEIVED from Appellant W Penn Alghny Health - Joint Appendix. Copies: 4. Volumes: 3 (Volume I attached to Brief and Volume III HELD UNDER SEAL). (MCW) | | |
| 02/05/2010 | 4 pg, 98.67 KB | NON COMPLIANCE Order issued to Appellant W Penn Alghny Health regarding the appendix filed on 01/26/2010. Please open the attachment for the full text of the Order. Compliance due by 02/10/2010. (EMA) | | |
| 02/08/2010 | 1 pg, 49.63 KB | ECF FILER: ENTRY OF APPEARANCE from Nancy Winkelman on behalf of Appellee(s) UPMC. (NAS) | | |
| 02/08/2010 | 16 pg, 298.48 KB | ECF FILER: ELECTRONIC ADDENDUM to APPENDIX on behalf of Appellant W Penn Alghny Health containing District Court Docket Sheet, filed. Certificate of Service dated 02/08/2010 by hand delivery, email. (BAB) | | |
| 02/08/2010 | 2 pg, 22.48 KB | ORDER (Clerk) considering Motions for leave to file supplemental appendix and to file supplemental appendix under seal. The motions for leave to file supplemental appendix are granted in part. To the extent the motions seek to seal the supplemental appendices, the motions are referred to the merits pane, filed. SEND TO MERITS PANEL. (Please see order for full text of the Order) (TMK) | | |
| 02/08/2010 | | HARD COPY RECEIVED from Appellant W Penn Alghny Health - Addendum to Appendix. Copies: 4. (RM) | | |
| 02/09/2010 | 6 pg, 35.91 KB | ECF FILER: UNOPPOSED Motion filed by Appellant W Penn Alghny Health to seal Volume III Of The Joint Appendix. Certificate of Service dated 02/09/2010. SEND TO MERITS PANEL[Edited 03/05/2010 by EMA] (BTS) | | |
| 02/09/2010 | | COMPLIANCE RECEIVED. Received addendum to appendix both electronically and hard copies containing the DC docket and a motion to seal joint appendix volume III. (EMA) | | |
| 03/01/2010 | 57 pg, 266.56 KB | ECF FILER: ELECTRONIC BRIEF on behalf of Appellee Highmark Inc, filed. Certificate of Service dated 03/01/2010 by clerk. (DIB) | | |
| 03/01/2010 | 72 pg, 231.81 KB | ECF FILER: ELECTRONIC BRIEF on behalf of Appellee UPMC, filed. Certificate of Service dated 03/01/2010 by US mail. (JMJ) | | |
| 03/01/2010 | | HARD COPY RECEIVED from Appellee UPMC - Brief. Copies: 10. (KEL) | | |
| 03/02/2010 | | HARD COPY RECEIVED from Appellee Highmark Inc - Brief. Copies: 10. (KEL) | | |
| 03/03/2010 | 1 pg, 19.74 KB | ORDER (Clerk) The foregoing motion by Appellant for leave to Seal Volume III of the Joint Appendix is referred to the merits panel. The Clerk is directed to hold Volume III of the joint appendix under seal pending disposition of the motion. SEND TO MERITS PANEL. (EMA) | | |
| 03/18/2010 | 39 pg, 182.28 KB | ECF FILER: ELECTRONIC REPLY BRIEF on behalf of Appellant W Penn Alghny Health, filed. Certificate of Service dated 03/18/2010 by hand delivery, email. (BAB) | | |
| 03/18/2010 | | HARD COPY RECEIVED from Appellant W Penn Alghny Health - Reply Brief. Copies: 10. (SJB) | | |
| 05/07/2010 | 33 pg, 160.67 KB | ECF FILER: Letter dated 5/7/10 , filed pursuant to Rule 28(j) from counsel for Appellant. This document will be SENT TO THE MERITS PANEL, if/when applicable. Certificate of Service dated 05/07/2010 [Edited 05/10/2010 by TYW] (BTS) | | |
| 05/12/2010 | 2 pg, 757.41 KB | ECF FILER: Response filed by Appellee Highmark Inc to Rule 28(j) letter. Certificate of Service dated 05/12/2010. This document will be SENT TO THE MERITS PANEL, if/when applicable. (DMD) | | |
| 06/11/2010 | 2 pg, 144.3 KB | Calendared for Wednesday, 09/15/2010 (Rescheduled from Tuesday, 09/14/2010) (CMH) | | |
| 06/11/2010 | 2 pg, 21.73 KB | ECF FILER: ARGUMENT ACKNOWLEDGMENT filed by Attorney Jonathan M. Jacobson, Esq. for Appellee UPMC. Certificate of Service dated 06/11/2010. (JMJ) | | |
| 06/15/2010 | 2 pg, 719.57 KB | ECF FILER: ARGUMENT ACKNOWLEDGMENT filed by Attorney Daniel I. Booker, Esq. for Appellee Highmark Inc. Certificate of Service dated 06/15/2010. (DIB) | | |
| 06/17/2010 | 2 pg, 94.13 KB | ECF FILER: ARGUMENT ACKNOWLEDGMENT filed by Attorney Barbara W. Mather, Esq. for Appellant W Penn Allegheny Health System. Certificate of Service dated 06/17/2010. (BWM) | | |
| 07/27/2010 | 54 pg, 385.12 KB | ECF FILER: Letter dated 07/27/2010 , filed pursuant to Rule 28(j) from counsel for Appellee UPMC. This document will be SENT TO THE MERITS PANEL, if/when applicable. (JMJ) | | |
| 07/27/2010 | 54 pg, 1.19 MB | ECF FILER: Letter dated 07/27/2010 , filed pursuant to Rule 28(j) from counsel for Appellee Highmark Inc. This document will be SENT TO THE MERITS PANEL, if/when applicable. (DIB) | | |
| | | | | |

09-4468 Docket Page 7 of 8

| 07/30/2010 | 3 pg, 147.93 KB | ECF FILER: Letter dated 07/30/2010, filed pursuant to Rule 28(j) from counsel for Appellant W Penn Allegheny Health System. This document will be SENT TO THE MERITS PANEL, if/when applicable. (BTS) | |
|------------|-------------------|---|--|
| 08/18/2010 | 1 pg, 79.46 KB | Oral Argument Notification for Wednesday, 09/15/2010. (PM) | |
| 08/24/2010 | 2 pg, 22.85 KB | ECF FILER: DIVISION OF TIME FORM filed by Attorney Jonathan M. Jacobson, Esq. for Appellee UPMC. Certificate of Service dated 08/24/2010. (JMJ) | |
| 09/02/2010 | 203 pg, 877.76 KB | ECF FILER: Letter dated 09/02/2010 , filed pursuant to Rule 28(j) from counsel for Appellee UPMC. This document will be SENT TO THE MERITS PANEL, if/when applicable. (JMJ) | |
| 09/02/2010 | 1 pg, 16.89 KB | ECF FILER: LETTER on behalf of Appellee Highmark Inc. Appellee Highmark Inc will adopt the Rule 28(j) Letter by UPMC Filed on September 2, 2010 on behalf of Appellee UPMC. Certificate of Service dated 09/02/2010. This document will be SENT TO THE MERITS PANEL if/when applicable. (DMD) | |
| 09/08/2010 | 3 pg, 50.13 KB | ECF FILER: Letter dated 09/08/2010, filed pursuant to Rule 28(j) from counsel for Appellant W Penn Allegheny Health System. This document will be SENT TO THE MERITS PANEL, if/when applicable. (BTS) | |
| 09/15/2010 | 1 pg, 256.75 KB | ECF FILER: LETTER on behalf of Attorney Donna M. Doblick, Esq. for Appellee Highmark Inc advising the Court of editing errors in the brief. Certificate of Service dated 09/15/2010. SEND TOMERITS PANEL[Edited 09/15/2010 by MS] (DMD) | |
| 09/15/2010 | | Argued on Wednesday, September 15, 2010 before SLOVITER, BARRY and SMITH, Circuit Judges. Daniel I. Booker arguing for Appellee Highmark, Inc.,; Jonathan M. Jacobson arguing for Appellee UPMC Barbara W. Mather arguing for Appellant Barbara W. Mather. (CMH) | |
| 09/15/2010 | 4 pg, 830.17 KB | ECF FILER: LETTER on behalf of Attorney Jonathan M. Jacobson, Esq. for Appellee UPMC, sent for the court's information in reference to a discussion during oral argument. Certificate of Service dated 09/15/2010[Edited 09/15/2010 by CMH] (JMJ) | |
| 11/29/2010 | 44 pg, 244.2 KB | PRECEDENTIAL OPINION Coram: SLOVITER, BARRY and SMITH, Circuit Judges. Total Pages: 44. Judge: SMITH Authoring. (TYW) | |
| 11/29/2010 | 6 pg, 50.65 KB | JUDGMENT the judgment of the District Court entered October 29, 2009 is reversed in part and vacated in part and the matter is remanded for further proceedings. Each party to bear its own costs. (TYW) | |
| 12/13/2010 | 68 pg, 291.24 KB | ECF FILER: Petition filed by Appellee UPMC for Rehearing before original panel and the court en banc. Certificate of Service dated 12/13/2010. (NAS) | |
| 12/13/2010 | 64 pg, 1.12 MB | ECF FILER: Petition filed by Appellee Highmark Inc for Rehearing before original panel and the court enbanc. Certificate of Service dated 12/13/2010. (DIB) | |
| 12/29/2010 | 2 pg, 22.12 KB | ORDER (MCKEE, Chief Judge, SLOVITER, SCIRICA, BARRY, AMBRO, FUENTES, SMITH, CHAGARES, JORDAN, GREENAWAY and VANASKIE, Circuit Judges) denying En Banc Rehearing filed by Appellee UPMC, denying En Banc Rehearing filed by Appellee Highmark Inc; denying for Panel Rehearing filed by Appellee Highmark Inc, filed. D. Brooks Smith, Authoring Judge. (MB) | |
| 12/29/2010 | 73 pg, 323.71 KB | ECF FILER: Motion filed by Appellee UPMC to stay mandate. Certificate of Service dated 12/29/2010. (NAS) | |
| 12/29/2010 | 28 pg, 88.31 KB | ECF FILER: Motion filed by Appellee Highmark Inc to stay mandate. Certificate of Service dated 12/29/2010. (DMD) | |
| 01/04/2011 | 1 pg, 23.22 KB | ORDER (SLOVITER, BARRY and SMITH, Circuit Judges) denying Motion by Appellees UPMC and Highmark Inc for stay of the mandate, filed. Smith, Authoring Judge. (TYW) | |
| 01/05/2011 | 48 pg, 321.66 KB | MANDATE ISSUED, filed. (TH) | |
| 03/14/2011 | | U.S. Supreme Court Letter dated 03/09/2011 granting Appellee Highmark Inc an extension of time to and including 04/28/2011 to file petition for writ of certiorari. Supreme Court Application No. 10A878. (CRG) | |

09-4468 Docket Page 8 of 8

| Clear All | | | | | | |
|--|---------------------|--------------|--|--|--|--|
| Documents and Docket SDocuments Only | ummary | | | | | |
| Include Page Numbers | | | | | | |
| Selected Pages: 0 | Selected Size: 0 KB | (Max: 25 MB) | | | | |
| Totals reflect accessible documents only and do not include unauthorized restricted documents. | | | | | | |
| View Selected | | | | | | |